# Journal of Pharmaceutical Research International



**31(6): 1-7, 2019; Article no.JPRI.53959 ISSN: 2456-9119** (Past name: British Journal of Pharmaceutical Research, Past ISSN: 2231-2919, NLM ID: 101631759)

# Evaluating the Synergistic Activity of Metformin and Apple Cider Vinegar in Type 2 Diabetics

Momina Abid<sup>1\*</sup>, Farah Ahmed<sup>2</sup>, Shehla Shaheen<sup>1</sup>, Zahida Memon<sup>1</sup>, M. Zaman Shaikh<sup>3</sup> and Faiza Agha<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Pharmacology, Ziauddin Medical College, Ziauddin University, Pakistan.
<sup>2</sup>Department of Community Medicine, Ziauddin Medical College, Ziauddin University, Pakistan.
<sup>3</sup>Department of Medicine, Sir Syed College of Medical Sciences, Pakistan.
<sup>4</sup>Department of Biochemistry, Liaquat Medical College and Hospital, Pakistan.

### Authors' contributions

The work was carried out in collaboration among all authors. Author MA designed the study, did the literature search and drafted the initial manuscript. Author FA did the statistical analysis and reviewed the manuscript. Author SS did the literature search and helped in drafting the final manuscript. Authors ZM and FA helped in drafting the final manuscript. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

#### Article Information

DOI: 10.9734/JPRI/2019/v31i630376 <u>Editor(s):</u> (1) Dr. R. Deveswaran, Associate Professor and Head, Drug Design and Development Centre, Faculty of Pharmacy, M. S. Ramaiah University of Applied Sciences, India. <u>Reviewers:</u> (1) Naser Ahmed Mahmoud Elsawy, Zagazig University, Egypt. (2) Zehuan Liao, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. Complete Peer review History: <u>http://www.sdiarticle4.com/review-history/53959</u>

**Original Research Article** 

Received 01 November 2019 Accepted 06 January 2020 Published 10 January 2020

# ABSTRACT

**Aims:** The aim of this study was to observe the effect of Apple Cider Vinegar (ACV) in combination with Metformin on the Body Mass Index (BMI) and glycemic control of newly diagnosed type 2 diabetic patients.

Study Design: Single arm pre post quasi experimental clinical trial.

**Place and Duration of Study:** Department of Medicine of a tertiary care hospital and a Diabetes and Endocrinology clinic, based in Karachi, Pakistan from April to July 2019.

**Methodology:** A total of 30 newly diagnosed type 2 diabetic patients were enrolled in the study (Males: 17; females: 13; age range: 27-55 years) after obtaining written informed consent. The parameters of Body weight, BMI, Fasting Blood Sugar (FBS) and Hemoglobin  $A_{1c}$  (Hb $A_{1c}$ ) of each patient were assessed before and after 12 weeks of treatment with Metformin 750 mg plus 2

\*Corresponding author: E-mail: momina9134@zu.edu.pk;

tablespoons of ACV per day. The baseline and post treatment values of the aforementioned were compared with each other.

**Results:** In all the 30 patients assessed after 12 weeks of treatment, the weight was significantly reduced from  $85.66\pm18.30$  kg. to  $82.96\pm18.43$  kg with a consequently significant change in the BMI from  $29.38\pm5.08$  kg/m<sup>2</sup> to  $28.43\pm5.16$  kg/m<sup>2</sup>. Moreover, the glycemic control, assessed as FBS and HbA<sub>1c</sub> also showed significant reduction in the FBS ( $127.76\pm9.17$  to  $121.23\pm9.54$ ) and HbA<sub>1c</sub> ( $7.14\pm0.29$  to  $6.92\pm0.29$ ) after 12 weeks of treatment in all 30 patients (p<0.01).

**Conclusion:** Apple Cider Vinegar seems to be effective therapy in combination with metformin for newly diagnosed type 2 diabetic patients in improving glycemic control as well as augmenting weight reduction.

Keywords: Diabetes mellitus; metformin; apple cider vinegar; body mass index; fasting blood sugar; hemoglobin A<sub>1c</sub>.

## ABBREVIATIONS

DM: Diabetes Mellitus;BMI: Body Mass Index;FBS: Fasting Blood Sugar;HbA1c: Hemoglobin A1c (Glycated Hemoglobin);ACV: Apple Cider Vinegar;OD: Once Daily.

# **1. INTRODUCTION**

With an alarming increase in the rate of incidence by over 90 percent in the past decade [1] diabetes mellitus is a major health concern contributing significantly to the global burden of disease [2] Type 2, previously known as Non-Insulin dependent DM, eventually leads to a state of chronic hyperglycemia resulting in a vast array of complications [3].

Although the precise molecular mechanism leading to type 2 diabetes is yet to be fully understood, it is principally the result of both genetic and environmental factors. The eventual pathophysiology is impairment of insulin secretion and insulin resistance, whereas the major environmental factors are a sedentary lifestyle, unhealthy eating habits and obesity amongst others [4].

BMI (Body Mass Index) is a crude measure of obesity in adults that categorizes them into aroups based on the anthropometric measurements of weight and height, widely used in population-based studies as an indicator of body fat [5]. Hence it could be postulated that an increase in BMI due to an increase in weight predispose genetically susceptible would individuals to the development of diabetes.

A member of the biguanide group, metformin seems to occupy the distinct position of being the

first line or drug of choice for the oral treatment of type 2 diabetes [6]. A major factor that attributes to this seems to be the ability of metformin to bring about weight loss, in both diabetic and nondiabetic individuals [7]. Its anti-glycemic property seems to be an effect of improving insulin sensitivity as well as decreased glucose synthesis by the liver, amongst other mechanisms [8].

The use of vinegar for its medicinal properties dates back to many centuries ago [9], however there has been a recent upsurge of interest in one of its types. Apple Cider Vinegar as a therapeutic agent. Recent studies strongly suggest the anti-glycemic properties of apple cider vinegar due to its glucose-lowering effects, both postprandially [10], as well as evident by a decrease in Hemoglobin A<sub>1C</sub> [11]. Moreover multiple studies support the evidence of weight loss after treatment with apple cider vinegar hence highlighting its role in weight reduction as well [12,13]. However these evidences are preliminary and warrant further research, Especially important to note is that there is scarce evidence of the combined effect of herbal agents like apple cider vinegar with conventional therapy like metformin, on the glycemic control of type 2 diabetes patients. Hence, this study aims to observe the synergistic activity of metformin and apple cider vinegar in weight reduction as well as glycemic control of newly diagnosed type 2 diabetics.

## 2. PATIENTS AND METHODS

## 2.1 Clinical Trial Design and Setting

This is an open label single arm pre and post quasi experimental clinical trial. With 99% confidence interval, 95% power, and an effect size of 1.538, the minimum required sample size

was calculated to be 12 using an online sample size calculator (http://statulator.com/SampleSize/ss2PM.html). A total of 30 patients (n=30) however were enrolled using the consecutive sampling technique over the duration of April to July 2019 (12 weeks for each patient) at the Department of Medicine of a tertiary care hospital and a Diabetes and Endocrinology clinic, both in Karachi, Pakistan.

## 2.2 Participant Criteria

A total of 30 patients with an age range in between 27-55 years having the following characteristics were included in this study:

- Newly diagnosed with Diabetes Mellitus Type 2.
- Hemoglobin A<sub>1c</sub> in between 6.5% to 7.5%.
- No known allergies to apple or any kind of vinegar.
- Able to understand and communicate effectively.

All patients unable to meet the above mentioned criteria or those taking any therapy for Diabetes were excluded from the study.

# 2.3 Study Design

A patient proforma enlisiting biodata and relevant health conditions and allergies was administered after explaining the entire procedure of the study in detail and obtaining written informed consent from the patients. The newly diagnosed diabetic patients were given conventional therapy in the form of Metformin 750 mg OD whereas they were additionally instructed to take 2 tablespoons of organically sourced Apple Cider Vinegar per day, for 12 weeks. The ACV bottles were all provided by the researcher from the same source to ensure uniformity.

Anthropometrically, the height was measured using a standard calibrated scale in feet and inches whereas the weight was measured in kilograms using a weighing scale with standard calibration with a maximum capacity of 125 kg. The Body Mass Index was then calculated by an online calculator via the formula:

Metric units: BMI = weight (kg)  $\div$  height  $\frac{2}{3}$  (m<sup>2</sup>).

The parameters of glycemic control; Fasting Blood Sugar and Hemoglobin A<sub>1c</sub> were analysed

at Ziauddin Laboratory, Karachi both at the start and at the end of 12 weeks for each patient

#### 2.4 Statistical Analysis

The data analysis was done using the software SPSS version 20. Parametric numerical variables were expressed as mean and standard deviation whereas non parametric numerical variables were expressed as median and interquartile range. Categorical variables were expressed as frequencies and percentages. The pre and post comparison of weight and BMI was done using the paired t test whereas the Wilcoxon signed rank test was used for pre and post comparison of FBS and HbA<sub>1c</sub> A *p* value of <0.01 was considered statistically significant.

#### 3. RESULTS

The demographical features of the patients depicted a mean age of patients to be  $41.56\pm7.70$  years. The gender distribution reflected a slight male predominance (56.7%) and a majority of the patients married (83.3%) (Table 1).

Table 1. Demographical characteristics of patients enrolled in the study (n=30)

Demographical characteristics		Mean±SD/n(%)		
Age (years)		41.56±7.70		
Gender	Male	17(56.7%)		
	Female	13(43.3%)		
Marital status	Married	25(83.3%)		
	Unmarried	5(16.7%)		

The mean height observed among the 30 patients was  $5.66\pm0.31$ . The weight of the patients observed before treatment with Metformin and Apple Cider Vinegar was  $85.66\pm18.30$  kg whereas after treatment it reduced significantly to  $82.96\pm18.43$  kg (*p* value <0.001). Similarly the BMI before treatment was 29.38 $\pm$ 5.08 kg/m<sup>2</sup> which also showed a noteworthy reduction to 28.43 $\pm$ 5.16 kg/m<sup>2</sup> (*p* value <0.001) (Table 2).

With consideration to the glycemic control of the patients (Table 3) there was a decrease in the Fasting blood Sugar levels of the patients from 127.76 $\pm$ 9.17mg/dl to 121.23 $\pm$ 9.54 mg/dl which was statistically significant (*p* value <0.001). In addition, the decline in Glycated Hemoglobin (HbA<sub>1c</sub>) was also observed from 7.14% $\pm$ 0.29 at the start and then 6.92% $\pm$ 0.29 by the end of 12 weeks of treatment.

Anthropometric parameters	Pre intervention	Post intervention	P value	
	Mean ± SD	Mean ± SD	_	
Height (feet and inches)	5.66±0.31			
Weight (kg)	85.66±18.30	82.96±18.43	<0.001*	
BMI (kg/m <sup>2</sup> )	29.38±5.08	28.43±5.16	<0.001*	

 
 Table 2. Anthropometric parameters of patients before and after treatment with metformin and ACV

Pre and post values obtained from paired t test, \* shows significant p values of <0.01

Table 3. Glycemic control of patients before and treatment with metformin and ACV

Parameters of	Pre intervention		Post intervention		p-		
glycemic control	Mean ± SD	Median(IQR)	Mean ± SD	Median(IQR)	value		
FBS(mg/dl)	127.76±9.17	130.5(121.7-134.2)	121.23±9.54	124.5(115.0-130.0)	<0.001*		
Hb A1c %	7.14±0.29	7.2(6.9-7.4)	6.92±0.29	7.0(6.6-7.2)	<0.001*		
Pre and post values from the Wilcoxon-signed rank test, * shows significant p values of <0.01							

4. DISCUSSION

It is common knowledge that Diabetes Mellitus Type 2 is now one of the most prevalent chronic diseases around the globe, posing grave challenges to public health worldwide [14]. All in all, the risk factors mainly happen to be physically inactive lifestyles along with unhealthy eating habits [15], leading to obesity. Therefore weight gain is one of the major modifiable risk factors of the disease and can also be postulated to have an effect on glycemic control. The eventual pathophysiological change seems to be resistance to insulin in the body or ultimately loss of insulin production leading to a state of chronic hyperglycemia, which may cause multiple microvascular as well as macrovascular complications if left untreated [16].

Our study shows demographical features of male predominance in the study sample which is in line with the demographic profile of a cross sectional study conducted on newly diagnosed type 2 diabetics in Pakistan, as well as a mean age of  $41.56 \pm 7.70$  years which is comparable to  $49.6 \pm 8.5$  years found in the same study reported by Naqvi, et al. [17].

The present study observes a significant reduction in the weight of the patients after treatment with a combination of metformin and apple cider vinegar with a subsequent decline in the BMI (Table 2), highlighting the role of this combination as a possibly successful therapy to augment weight loss in type 2 diabetics. There are multiple studies that support the claim of weight loss by metformin [18,19] and there is also emerging evidence of weight loss caused by apple cider vinegar [20], however there seems to be scarce information regarding the combination therapy of ACV with metformin.

Metformin is an established first line drug for the treatment of diabetes mellitus type 2 due to its stellar advantage to bring about weight loss. [21,22]. However, in cases of inadequate control by metformin alone, different anti diabetic agents may be administered in combination to achieve better glycemic control [23]. Also important to note is that metformin is widely reported for significant gastrointestinal distress, as well as Vitamin B<sub>12</sub> deficiency [24,25].

Multiple studies carried out in humans and animals also suggest the antidiabetic effect of apple cider vinegar when used alone. Halima et al reported decreased blood glucose level as well as increased antioxidant activity in diabetic rats after 4 weeks of administration of apple cider vinegar [26]. A study done by Mohammad Pourhodki, et al. on 74 diabetic patients also reported significantly reduced FBS and HbA<sub>1c</sub> levels after 8 weeks of administration of ACV [27]. A recent clinical trial reports significant reduction in the Fasting Blood Sugar and Hemoglobin A<sub>1c</sub> levels after administration of ACV in type 2 diabetic patients with poor glycemic control [28].

Our study observes a significant reduction in the level of both Fasting Blood Sugar as well as Hemoglobin  $A_{1c}$  after the 12 week period of treatment with metformin and apple cider vinegar combination, showing the beneficial effects of this combination on glycemic control. Many reviews also support the claim of apple cider vinegar as an anti diabetic remedy, in addition to other properties, like being an anti-oxidant, an

effective weight loss agent, having a possible role in managing hyperlipidemia, as well as its potential role as an anti hypertensive agent [29-31].

Moreover a clinical trial reported by Gheflati et al also supports the notion of ACV improving glycemic control in type 2 diabetic patients [32]. Apple cider vinegar is prepared from fermented apples, the possible reason behind the weight reducing and glucose lowering effects of ACV could be its chief active ingredient acetic acid [33]. Still at the molecular level the benefits of ACV should be explored to know the exact mechanisms of its anti-glycemic and weight reducing effects.

Therefore, this study explores the niche of combination of conventional and herbal treatment, i.e metformin and apple cider vinegar, respectively, which to the best of our knowledge is somewhat innovative. However this trial is prone to bias due to a smaller sample size as well as the absence of a control group for comparison. Therefore we strongly recommend clinical trials on larger sample sizes and comparative groups to strengthen the claim of this study.

## **5. CONCLUSION**

Our study examines the synergistic effect of Metformin, a first line pharmaceutical agent with ACV, a traditional herbal remedy, revealing increased weight loss and improved glycemic control in newly diagnosed type 2 diabetic patients manifesting as significant decreases in BMI, FBS and HbA<sub>1c</sub>. However, it is preliminary and certainly requires more evidence on larger sample sizes and diverse populations and comparative studies with conventional treatment groups.

#### CONSENT

This study was conducted in accordance with the Declaration of Helsinki. Ethical Approval was obtained from the institutional ethics board (Ethics Review Committee) of Ziauddin University. The patients were explained the entire procedure in detail and written informed consent was obtained with due diligence.

# ETHICAL APPROVAL

All authors hereby declare that all experiments have been examined and approved by the

appropriate ethics committee and have therefore been performed in accordance with the ethical standards laid down in the 1964 Declaration of Helsinki.

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

We would like to thank Dr Akhtar Ali, Dr Urooj Zafar and Dr Dabeeran Zehra, Lecturers at Department of Pharmacology, Ziauddin Medical College and Dr Faiza Quraishi, Lecturer at Department of Pharmacology, Shaheed Mohterma Benazir Bhutto Medical College, Lyari for their advice and help in managing logistics related to this publication. We would also like to thank Dr. Kauser Ismail, Assistant Professor, Department of Pharmacology, Ziauddin Medical College for her input and advice in the study design.

#### **COMPETING INTERESTS**

Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

### REFERENCES

- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). State-specific incidence of diabetes among adults--participating states, 1995-1997 and 2005-2007. MMWR. Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report. 2008;57(43):1169.
- Anonymous. WHO, W. The top 10 causes of death; 2014. (Accessed 15<sup>th</sup> December 2019) Available:https://www.who.int/newsroom/fact-sheets/detail/the-top-10-causesof-death
- Ozougwu JC, Obimba KC, Belonwu CD, Unakalamba CB. The pathogenesis and pathophysiology of type 1 and type 2 diabetes mellitus. Journal of Physiology and Pathophysiology. 2013;4(4):46-57.
- 4. Kohei KAKU. Pathophysiology of type 2 diabetes and its treatment policy. JMAJ. 2010;53(1):41-46.
- Nuttall FQ. Body mass index: obesity, BMI, and health: A critical review. Nutrition. 2015;50(3):117.
- Samson SL, Garber AJ. Metformin and other biguanides: Pharmacology and therapeutic usage. International Textbook of Diabetes Mellitus. 2015;641-656.
- Praharaj SK, Jana AK, Goyal N, Sinha VK. Metformin for olanzapine-induced weight gain: A systematic review and meta-

Abid et al.; JPRI, 31(6): 1-7, 2019; Article no.JPRI.53959

analysis. British Journal of Clinical Pharmacology. 2011;71(3):377-382.

- Silvia S, Franco G, Fabio V, De GP, lacoviello M, Licchelli B, Guastamacchia E, Giagulli V, Triggiani V. Metformin: Up to Date. Endocrine, Metabolic & Immune Disorders Drug Targets; 2019.
- 9. Johnston CS, Gaas CA. Vinegar: Medicinal uses and antiglycemic effect. Medscape General Medicine. 2006;8(2):61.
- Johnston CS, Buller AJ. Vinegar and peanut products as complementary foods to reduce postprandial glycemia. Journal of the American Dietetic Association. 2005; 105(12):1939-1942.
- 11. Johnston CS, White AM, Kent SM. Preliminary evidence that regular vinegar ingestion favorably influences hemoglobin A1c values in individuals with type 2 diabetes mellitus. Diabetes Research and Clinical Practice. 2009;84(2):e15e17.
- Kondo T, Kishi M, Fushimi T, Ugajin S, Kaga T. Vinegar intake reduces body weight, body fat mass and serum triglyceride levels in obese Japanese subjects. Bioscience, Biotechnology and Biochemistry. 2009;73(8):1837-1843.
- Pusparatha SB, Devi RG, Jyothipriya A. Effects of apple cider vinegar on diabetic and obese patients. Drug Invention. 2019; 12(5).
- 14. Chen L, Magliano DJ, Zimmet PZ. The worldwide epidemiology of type 2 diabetes mellitus—present and future perspectives. Nat Rev Endocrinol. 2011; 8:228–36.
- 15. Violi F, Targher G, Vestri A, et al. Effect of aspirin on renal disease progression in patients with type 2 diabetes: A multicenter, double-blind, placebocontrolled, randomized trial. The renaL disEase progression by aspirin in diabetic pAtients (LEDA) trial. Rationale and study design. Am Heart J. 2017;189:120–7.
- Gardner CD, Trepanowski JF, Del Gobbo LC, et al. Effect of low-fat vs lowcarbohydrate diet on 12-month weight loss in overweight adults and the association with genotype pattern or insulin secretion: The DIETFITS randomized clinical trial. JAMA. 2018;319:667–79.
- 17. Naqvi IH, Talib A, Akhter ST, Abdi SR, Rizvi SNZ, Ubaid M. Peripheral neuropathy and vasculopathy; Frequency and associated risk factors in newly diagnosed treatment naive type 2 diabetes. Open

Journal of Endocrine and Metabolic Diseases. 2008;8(05):125.

- Apolzan JW, Venditti EM, Edelstein SL, Knowler WC, Dabelea D, Boyko EJ, Pi-Sunyer X, Kalyani RR, Franks PW, Srikanthan P, Gadde KM. Long-term weight loss with metformin or lifestyle intervention in the diabetes prevention program outcomes study. Annals of Internal Medicine. 2019;170(10):682-690.
- Griffin C, McGowan E, Griffin M. May. weight loss in PCOS-benefits of metformin and liraglutide-a single institution experience. In 21st European Congress of Endocrinology Bio Scientifica. 2019;63.
- 20. Basharat S, Gilani SA, Qamar MM, Basharat A. Therapeutic effect of apple cider vinegar on diabetes mellitus. Rawal Medical Journal. 2019;44(4):884-887.
- 21. Sanchez-Rangel E, Inzucchi SE. Metformin: Clinical use in type 2 diabetes. Diabetologia. 2017;60(9):1586-1593.
- Xia C, Liang S, He Z, Zhu X, Chen R, Chen J. Metformin, a first-line drug for type 2 diabetes mellitus, disrupts the MALAT1/miR-142-3p sponge to decrease invasion and migration in cervical cancer cells. European Journal of Pharmacology. 2018;830:59-67.
- 23. Pratley RE, Eldor R, Raji A, Golm G, Huyck SB, Qiu Y, Sunga S, Johnson J, Terra SG, Mancuso JP, Engel SS. Ertugliflozin plus sitagliptin versus either individual agent over 52 weeks in patients with type 2 diabetes mellitus inadequately controlled with metformin: The vertis factorial randomized trial. Diabetes, Obesity and Metabolism. 2018;20(5): 1111-1120.
- 24. Yanto TA, Huang I, Kosasih FN, Lugito NPH. Nightmare and abnormal dreams: Rare side effects of metformin? Case Reports in Endocrinology; 2018.
- 25. Perry M. Metformin use and B12 deficiency. Journal of Prescribing Practice. 2019;1(Sup3):S10-S13.
- 26. Halima BH, Sarra K, Houda BJ, Sonia G, Abdallah A. Antidiabetic and antioxidant effects of apple cider vinegar on normal and streptozotocin-induced diabetic rats. International Journal for Vitamin and Nutrition Research; 2019.
- 27. Mohammad Pourhodki R, Sargolzaei MS. The effects of apple vinegar on fasting blood sugar (FBS) and glycosylated hemoglobin in patients with type 2

Abid et al.; JPRI, 31(6): 1-7, 2019; Article no.JPRI.53959

diabetes. Prensa Medica Argentina. 2019;104:1-4.

- Kausar S, Abbas MA, Hajra Ahmad NY, Ahmed Z, Humayun N, Ashfaq H, Humayun A. Effect of apple cider vinegar in type 2 diabetic patients with poor glycemic control: A randomized placebo controlled design®. Health Sciences. 2019; 8(2):149-159.
- 29. Morgan Joanna, Sapha Mosawy. The potential of apple cider vinegar in the management of type 2 diabetes. International Journal of Diabetes Research. 2016;5(6):129-34.
- Kausar S, Humayun A, Ahmed Z, Abbas MA, Tahir A. Effect of apple cider vinegar on glycemic control, hyperlipidemia and control on body weight in type 2 diabetes patients. Health Sciences. 2019;8(5): 59-74.

- Cheng LJ, Jiang Y, Wu XV, Wang W. A Systematic review and meta-analysis: vinegar consumption on glycemic control in adults with type 2 diabetes mellitus. Journal of Advanced Nursing; 2019.
- 32. Gheflati A, Bashiri R, Ghadiri-Anari A, Reza JZ, Kord MT, Nadjarzadeh A. The effect of apple vinegar consumption on glycemic indices, blood pressure, oxidative stress, and homocysteine in patients with type 2 diabetes and dyslipidemia: A randomized controlled clinical trial. Clinical Nutrition ESPEN. 2019;33:132-138.
- Santos HO, De Moraes WM, Da Silva GA, Prestes J, Schoenfeld BJ. Vinegar (acetic acid) intake on glucose metabolism: A narrative review. Clinical Nutrition ESPEN; 2019.

© 2019 Abid et al.; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Peer-review history: The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here: http://www.sdiarticle4.com/review-history/53959